

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July,
2016 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice-Chairman)

County Councillors: D. Blakebrough, R. Chapman, D. Dovey,
D. Edwards, D. Evans, J. Higginson, P. Murphy, M. Powell,
B. Strong, A. Webb and A. Wintle

ALSO PRESENT: County Councillors: A. Easson, R.P. Jordan, J. Prosser and V. Smith

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Mark Hand	Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Paula Clarke	Planning Applications and Enforcement Manager
Robert Tranter	Head of Legal Services & Monitoring Officer
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

Councillors R. Edwards, R. Harris and B. Hayward

1. Declarations of Interest

County Councillor A. Webb declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of planning application DC/2016/00532 due to her knowledge of the applicant. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 7th June 2016 were confirmed and signed by the Chairman. In doing so, the Head of Planning Place and Enterprise informed the Committee that the amendments to the Planning Committee Public Speaking Protocol have been agreed by individual Cabinet Member decision. The new protocol will be in force for the August 2016 Planning Committee meeting.

3. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2015/01136 - PROPOSED GLAMPING PODS WITH UTILITIES AND SERVICES BLOCK. FAIROAK, RUMBLE STREET, MONKSWOOD, NP15 1QG

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 13 conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence was also received in respect of this application.

The local Member for Llanbadoc, attending the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair, outlined the following points:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- There are single traffic roads to the site making it unsuitable for the proposed development.
- Campers frequently tow trailers. There can be no control regarding the type and size of vehicles arriving at the proposed site.
- There are no amenities within easy walking distance.
- In the event of the business ceasing, concern was expressed regarding the use of the new services block because that is a substantial permanent dwelling.
- Dwr Cwmru is keeping a watching brief regarding the septic tank.
- The twice yearly moving of the pods is unsuitable but by doing so, the application will comply with the policy. The local Member was not sure this was the right way to be undertaking such planning matters.
- How will such movements be monitored?
- The site has potential for expansion.
- Rumble Street is a short cut to Goytre. It is acknowledged that Rumble Street is a narrow rural lane with limited passing places and is signed as not being suitable for heavy vehicles.
- The Traffic and Development Manager considered the potential traffic volume increase and is of the view that there is no longer grounds to sustain an objection on highway safety grounds. However, the traffic department will not provide school transport for Monmouthshire's children along this lane. The lane is considered unsuitable to take a school bus along this route. School children walk this route every day.
- If the application is approved, it will further endanger children and local residents.

Mr. P. Fletcher, representing objectors to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair and outlined the following points:

- Residents of Rumble Street object to the application on road safety grounds, loss of amenity and believe that the application does not comply with policies T2 and EP1.
- Rumble Street is complex. It has unique characteristics and can only be appreciated by people who have lived there for a while.
- Commercialising the lane will change it with the detriment to most households for the financial benefit of one person.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July, 2016 at 2.00 pm

- The lane is already straining under the existing demands put upon it due to traffic throughput, drainage and structural integrity. The lane is one car wide with steep verges in places.
- School children, cyclists, dog walkers, horse riders and elderly people walk the lane. Large agricultural vehicles with livestock also use the lane.
- The 60mph speed limit encourages non-local people to drive much faster than is considered to be safe.
- An increase in vehicle numbers will incur an increase in risk.
- There are no amenities or organised activities within walking distance of the site. Therefore, regular car journeys are essential.
- Noise intrusion will occur contrary to information contained within the report of the application.
- The services block will be a permanent feature.
- There will be a risk to health and safety with the potential for open fires.
- Poor access exists for emergency service vehicles.

The applicant's agent, Mr. M. McLaughlin, attending the meeting by invitation of the Vice-Chair, outlined the following points:

- Monitoring of the site with regard to it only being occupied during the allocated months will be easy to achieve.
- The Traffic and Development Manager has no objections to the application.
- Policy RE6 allows for the provision of the service block.
- Material considerations have been answered by the application case officer.
- National Policies, not mentioned in the report of the application, i.e., Planning Policy Wales, provides support for the application at this site.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, Members considered that the proposed scheme was, on balance, a good scheme which promoted tourism within the County.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R.J. Higginson that application DC/2015/01136 be approved subject to the 13 conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July,
2016 at 2.00 pm

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01136 be approved subject to the 13 conditions, as outlined in the report.

4. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2013/00474 - A FIRST FLOOR EXTENSION TO 5 & 5A CHIPPENHAMGATE STREET TO PROVIDE A SINGLE, ONE BEDROOM DWELLING WITH THREE PARKING SPACES AT GROUND LEVEL.5 & 5A CHIPPENHAMGATE STREET, MONMOUTH NP25 3D

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to six conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence was also received in respect of this application.

In noting the detail of the application, Members expressed their support for the application but expressed concern regarding the proposed materials. It was considered that there was a need to change the external wall and roof materials and that white render should be provided with a slate roof.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor A.M. Wintle and seconded by County Councillor D.L.S. Dovey that consideration of application DC/2013/00474 be deferred to the next meeting to allow officers to liaise with the applicant with a view to changing the external wall and roof materials and that white render should be provided with a slate roof.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For deferral	-	12
Against deferral	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that consideration of application DC/2013/00474 be deferred to the next meeting to allow officers to liaise with the applicant with a view to changing the external wall and roof materials and that white render should be provided with a slate roof.

5. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2015/00832 - APPLICATION FOR REVISED WORKS CARRIED OUT TO BARN CONVERSION INCLUDING ENLARGEMENT OF RESIDENTIAL CURTILAGE. CARROW HILL FARM, CARROW ROAD, CARROW HILL, CAERWENT NP26 3AU

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the one condition, as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July, 2016 at 2.00 pm

In noting the detail of the application, Members were informed that the barn conversion had been presented to Planning Committee and approved in 2014. However, the barn conversion had not been carried out in accordance with the approved details. The application submitted is to regularise the breach of planning control. The main issue is the boundary wall and it had been recommended that this be reduced, as outlined in the condition to the report.

The local Member for Caerwent, also a Planning Committee, stated that he was in agreement with the application as it currently stands with the boundary wall remaining at its current height.

Having considered the application and the views expressed by the local Member, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor D. Evans that application DC/2015/00832 be approved with the removal of the one condition, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	10
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/00832 be approved with the removal of the one condition, as outlined in the report.

6. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2015/00890 - LAND TO REAR OF BEDFONT COTTAGE, NEWTOWN ROAD, GOYTRE. FOUR BEDROOM DWELLING ON GARDEN LAND TO THE REAR OF BEDFONT COTTAGES

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence had also been received in respect of this application.

In noting the detail of the application, Members were informed that the applicant would be willing to remove the dormer aspect of the application following concerns raised. An amended plan would be submitted incorporating this change. The Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping informed the Committee that a condition could be added to remove permitted development rights to retain control over future development that might cause harm to local amenity. In addition, it was agreed that there would be a need to agree by condition the finished floor level of the approved dwelling so that its height and impact could be kept to a reasonable level having regard to the amenity of adjacent neighbours.

Having considered the application and the views expressed it was proposed by County Councillor D.L.S. Dovey and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2015/00890 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition that permitted development rights be removed. In

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July, 2016 at 2.00 pm

addition, it was agreed that there would be a need to agree by condition the finished floor level of the approved dwelling so that its height and impact could be kept to a reasonable level having regard to the amenity of adjacent neighbours.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/00890 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition that permitted development rights be removed. In addition, it was agreed that there would be a need to agree by condition the finished floor level of the approved dwelling so that its height and impact could be kept to a reasonable level having regard to the amenity of adjacent neighbours.

7. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2015/01210 - PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT CONSISTING OF THREE DWELLINGS ADJACENT TO 21 FOUR ASH STREET. LAND ADJACENT 21 FOUR ASH STREET, USK

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the seven conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence had also been received in respect of this application.

The local Member for Usk, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed his support for the application.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, it was proposed by County Councillor B. Strong and seconded by County Councillor R.J. Higginson that application DC/2015/01210 be approved subject to the seven conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01210 be approved subject to the seven conditions, as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July,
2016 at 2.00 pm

8. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00444 - TO PROVIDE A DIGITAL SCREEN WITHIN A SECURE FRAME SITED ON EXISTING CIVIC SOCIETY NOTICE BOARD. PUBLIC OPEN SPACE, CROSS STREET, ABERGAVENNY

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Grofield, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed his support for the application.

It was noted that Abergavenny Town Council supported the application.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor D.L. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2016/00444 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00444 be approved subject to the six conditions, as outlined in the report.

9. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00494 - CHANGE OF USE OF HOTEL WITH C1 USE TO A1, A2 AND A3 USE ON THE GROUND FLOOR WITH B1 USE TO THE FIRST AND SECOND FLOORS. THE SWAN HOTEL, CROSS STREET, ABERGAVENNY, NP7 5ER

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence had also been received in respect of this application.

Concern was expressed that as Abergavenny Town Council had not responded to the application, consideration of the application by the Planning Committee should be deferred until such comments have been received.

It was noted that Planning Officers had emailed the application and also sent a copy by post to the Clerk to Abergavenny Town Council in order for the application to be considered by the Town Council's Planning Committee. However, it was noted that the Town Clerk had been on sick leave and it appeared that this matter had not been presented to the Town Council's Planning Committee.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor D.L. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that consideration of application DC/2016/00494 be deferred to the

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July, 2016 at 2.00 pm

next Planning Committee meeting to allow Abergavenny Town Council's Planning Committee time to consider the application and to submit comments to Monmouthshire County Council's Planning Department.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For deferral	-	12
Against deferral	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that consideration of application DC/2016/00494 be deferred to the next Planning Committee meeting to allow Abergavenny Town Council's Planning Committee time to consider the application and to submit comments to Monmouthshire County Council's Planning Department.

10. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00529 - PROVISION OF RAISED TIMBER DECK TO ACCOMMODATE TIMBER SUMMER HOUSE IN GARDEN. 4 TOYNBEE CLOSE, OSBASTON, MONMOUTH, NP25 3NU

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2016/00529 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00529 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

11. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00532 - 2.3M X 3M GREENHOUSE - EARTH BASE INSIDE. 3M X 3.7M GARDEN SHED TO STORE WOOD AND COAL. TO ALSO PROVIDE SOME SHELTER TO GREENHOUSE FROM EXPOSURE OF HIGH WINDS. ROCKMON VIEW, ROCKFIELD, MONMOUTH

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to two conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence had also been received in respect of this application.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 5th July, 2016 at 2.00 pm

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor R.J. Higginson and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2016/00532 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00532 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

12. Castle Oak, Usk, Monmouthshire NP15 1SG.

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit on 14th June 2016, site Castle Oak, Usk, Monmouthshire NP15 1SG.

The appeal had been dismissed.

13. Old Shop Cottage, Star Hill, Llanishen, Monmouthshire, NP16 6NT.

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit on 24th May 2016, site Old Shop Cottage, Star Hill, Llanishen, Monmouthshire NP16 6NT.

The appeal had been dismissed.

14. Appeals received - May to June 2016.

We noted the appeals received between May and June 2016.

The Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping informed the Committee that the Welsh Government has asked for volunteers for a pilot that involves ward Members in pre-application discussions. This is a 12 month trial commencing in September 2016. The Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping has put Monmouthshire County Council forward as a volunteer authority. This will allow Members to be involved in the process at a much earlier stage.

The meeting ended at 4.20 pm